# Feminism

Colonial and Postcolonial **Perspectives on Care** 

KANCHANA MAHADEVAN





### Contents

	Foreword – Veena Poonacha	vii
	Preface	xiii
	Acknowledgement	XXV
	Introduction: Philosophizing as Women	1
	Part 1	
	Colonial Perspectives	
1.	Pandita Ramabai and Feminism in Colonial India: Tradition, Modernity and Domestic Nurture	33
	The Construction of Indian Womanhood	34
	Ramabai's Feminist Voice	51
	Women in Indian Philosophy	63
2.	Feminine/Feminist Gestures in Colonial England: Mary Wollstonecraft	73
	British Radicalism, Critique of Empire and Female Manners	74
	Intersecting Spaces: "Entangled" and "Embattled"	83
	Female Ancestry	92
	Part 2	
	Postcolonial Contexts, Perspectives	
3.	The Ethics of Care: Carol Gilligan	105

This book explores feminism's reconstruction of autonomy through the care debate amongst feminist philosophers, global differences between women and the tension between femininity and feminism. It will interest students, teachers and scholars of colonial studies, cultural studies, gender studies, philosophy, postcolonialism and social sciences.

This important work begins by first recognizing the existence of a body of work across cultures that classifies as feminist philosophical thought to offer its nuanced and complex analyses. It does so in the context of the history of care, tracing differences, overlaps, resonances and hierarchies in the work of so-called 'Western' and 'non-Western' feminist writers and thinkers. The book offers a way of engaging with tensions in the field of philosophy through the critical role of women's thought.

Director, Zubaan Books, India

Between Femininity and Feminism not only provides an intervention into moral and feminist philosophy, but also challenges the privilege of Western feminisms, critiques imperialism and Indian nationalist forms of patriarchy to demonstrate the value of inter-disciplinarity, global philosophical reflections and intersections of difference (such as caste, religion, class, imperialism and patriarchy). It foregrounds the work of philosophy as a practical and transformative activity.

Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science University of Victoria, Canada

978-81-246-0730-5





#### BETWEEN FEMININITY AND FEMINISM xxiv

	Critique of Mainstream Ethics	107
	The Perspective of Care	118
	Care in Patriarchal and Colonial Contexts	123
4.	Integrating Justice and Care: Susan Okin	142
	Justice and Family: Critique of Rawls	143
	A Feminist Reinterpretation of Rawls	147
	Gender Justice: Liberalism and the Family	153
5.	Rethinking Freedom and Care: Simone	180
	de Beauvoir	
	The Disquietitudes of Individualist Freedom	182
	Relational Freedom, Embodied Situation and Ambiguity	192
	Reproductive Freedom in Global Contexts	212
	Afterword: Towards Global Feminisms	223
	Bibliography	242
	Index	264

Although the feminist debate on the ethics of care has demonstrated that philosophical concepts are gender-laden, the relation of care to justice and autonomy is not selfexplanatory. Moreover, given its Western context, the normative relevance of the care debate to non-Western feminisms remains problematic. This book addresses this debate and investigates the extent to which notions of justice and autonomy can be reformulated without Eurocentrism from the perspective of care.

In this endeavour, this book maps the shifts in feminist approaches to care from the colonial to the post-colonial periods, taking both interdisciplinarity and intersectionality into account. The book also argues that the feminist debate on care has contributed towards making philosophy's boundaries with culture and social science more porous.

Kanchana Mahadevan is Professor at the Department of Philosophy, University of Mumbai. Her teaching and research interests in philosophy include ethics, hermeneutics, critical theory, gender studies and political theory. She has published various papers in journals and anthologies on these themes.

20 X 2

Cover design by **Prajakti Pai** 

ISBN 978-81-246-0730-5

Rs. 600 US \$ 24.00

# Between Femininity and Feminism

Colonial and Postcolonial Perspectives on Care

Kanchana Mahadevan

with a Foreword by Veena Poonacha





Publishers of Indian Traditions

# PRINTWORL

# नागरिको

(प्लातोन की पोलितिया का हिन्दी अनुवाद)

<sub>अनुवादक</sub> राजेन्द्र स्वरूप भटनागर



## विषय सूची

भूमिका	V
अनुग्रह ज्ञापन	xvi
खण्ड 1. परिचय - न्याय, अन्याय (327 क - 354 ख)	1
खण्ड 2. समस्या, विचार की दिशा (357 क - 383 ग)	44
खण्ड 3. शिक्षा (प्रथम चरण) - संगीत और व्यायाम	81
(386 क - 417 ख)	
खण्ड ४. सद्गुण, नगर संरचना (४११ क - ४४५ ङ)	127
खण्ड 5. स्त्रियाँ, परिवार और नगर (449 क - 480 क)	165
खण्ड 6. दार्शनिक, शासन, शिक्षा (दूसरा चरण)	210
(484 क - 511 ङ)	
खण्ड 7. ज्ञान और सद्गुण (514 क - 541 ख)	249
खण्ड ८. शासन-व्यवस्था के चार रूप (543 क - 569 ग)	286
खण्ड 9. इच्छा, सुख और न्याय (571 क - 592 ख)	325
खण्ड 10. काव्य, यथार्थ, दर्शन और आत्मा (595 क - 621 ग)	358
अनुक्रमणिका	396

नागरिकी प्लातोन(प्लेटो) की पुस्तक पोलितीया का हिन्दी अनुवाद है। अंग्रेज़ी में इस पुस्तक के कई अनुवाद *रिपब्लिक* शीर्षक से प्रकाशित हुए हैं।

वस्तुत: रिपब्लिक शीर्षक पोलितीया का उपयुक्त अनुवाद नहीं है क्योंकि प्लातोन ने लोकतंत्र या जनतंत्र को स्वीकार नहीं किया, बल्कि उसमें कई दोष बताए हैं।

सामान्यतया *पोलितीया* का प्रमुख विषय राज्य अथवा नगर व्यवस्था माना जाता रहा है। बहुधा समझा जाता है कि इस संवाद में प्लातोन राज्य या नगर की एक आदर्श रूप-रेखा को अंकित करता है। परन्तु ऐसा प्रतीत होता है कि नगर अथवा राज्य का विवेचन यह दिखाने का एक मार्ग है कि न्याय क्या है, वह अन्याय से किस प्रकार भिन्न है, तथा व्यक्ति तथा नगर के रूप में वह क्या भूमिका रखता है।

इस अनुवाद में दो बातों का विशेष ध्यान रखा गया है। प्रथम तो यह कि इसका अध्ययन हमें हैलेनिकी अथवा ग्रीक परिवेश के अधिक निकट लाए। दूसरे इसमें संवाद का स्वरूप इस प्रकार निरूपित किया गया है जिससे पता चले कि वार्ता चिर-परिचित व्यक्तियों के बीच हो रही है। अनुवाद के द्वारा अनुवादक ने प्लातोन की सद्गुण-सम्बन्धी अवधारणा को भली-भाँति दर्शाने का प्रयत्न किया है। पोलितीया में सद्गुण का विवेचन व्यक्ति तथा समाज या नगर दोनों के संदर्भ में हुआ है। प्लातोन के अन्य संवादों की तुलना में यहाँ सद्गुण-विवेचन अधिक विशद रूप में हुआ है।

इस अनुवाद के प्रकाट्य का एक कारण यह भी है कि *पोलितीया* का हिन्दी अनुवाद इस समय सुलभ नहीं है, तथा इसका महत्त्व दर्शन के अतिरिक्त अन्य विषयों की दृष्टि से भी सर्वविदित है। राजेन्द्र स्वरूप भटनागर (जन्म 1 जनवरी 1933) ने इलाहाबाद विश्वविद्यालय से 1959 में डी॰फिल्॰ की उपाधि ग्रहण की। आपने सी॰एम॰पी॰ कॉलेज इलाहाबाद, बनस्थली विद्यापीठ तथा राजस्थान विश्वविद्यालय में दर्शनशास्त्र का अध्यापन कार्य किया। इनके द्वारा अनेक दार्शनिक गोष्टियों में पत्रवाचन एवं अनेक पत्र विभिन्न पत्रिकाओं में प्रकाशित हैं। इनकी दर्शन परिचय के अतिरिक्त बर्किले तथा पाश्चात्य चिन्तन पर पुस्तकों प्रकाशित हैं।

ISBN 978-81-246-0735-0

Rs. 900.00 US \$ 36.00

## नागरिकी

(प्लातोन की पोलितीया का हिन्दी अनुवाद) (Hindi Translation of Plato's Republic)

> अनुवादक **राजेन्द्र स्वरूप भटनागर**







# Advaita Metaphysics

— A CONTEMPORARY PERSPECTIVE —



#### Contents

	Prologue	V
	Preamble	1
1.	Formulation of Advaitism — Śańkara	11
	Analysis of Propositional Form: Subject and Predicate	13
	Principle of Predication	16
	First Statement: Smrtirūpaḥ-Paratra-	17
	Pūrvadṛṣṭa-Avabhāsaḥ	
	Second Statement: Anyasya Anyadharma	19
	Avabhāṣatām	
	Third Statement: Atasmin Tadbuddhi	20
	Resultant Concept	21
	Ātman: Defining Characteristics	23
	Sat-Cit-Ānanda	26
	Identity of Ātman and Brahman	28
2.	Metaphysics of Advaita Vedānta: A Review — G.R. Malkani	29
	Advaita Theology	30
	Elucidation of Advaita Doctrine	37
	Advaita Criterion of Reality	. 38
	Ultimate Reality and Causal Doctrine	39
	Analysis of Svarūpa Lakṣaṇa of Brahman	41
	Sat (Being)	42

Upanisads have been viewed differently by commentators down the centuries. Philosophers have brought in their native presuppositions in interpreting the Upanisadic texts. Advaitavāda (monism) of Śańkara stands out conspicuous among the varied interpretations of the Upanisads. Ontology, having been basic and fundamental, logic, epistemology and ethics are parasitic on it. Thinkers like G.R. Malkani, K.S. Murty and G. Misra offer alternative perspectives in understanding concepts and doctrines of the Upanisads.

This book undertakes the study of Advaitavāda of Śaṅkara in its depth and extension. It spells out the relative cogency of Malkani's understanding of Advaita Metaphysics and Methodology, Murty's Critique of Advaita (nondualism) and Misra's Philosophical Construction of Advaita from a linguistic perspective. This volume centres around the formulations of the Advaita theory of monism on the basis of epistemological and logical analysis of knowledge in *Adhyāsa Bhāṣya*.

This title is a significant addition to the existing literature on Advaita philosophy and shall be of profound interest for scholars at large.



Dr Tapti Maitra has an eventful academic career, with post-graduation from the University of Calcutta. She joined Orissa Education Service and subsequently, Post Graduate Department of Philosophy, Utkal University. Besides several research publications to her credit, she has authored *A Constructive Study of Advaita Conception of Mind.* She is greatly devoted to the study of Advaita Vedānta of Śaṅkara. She is known for her in-depth study of the seminal concepts and foundational issues in Advaita Vedānta from the logico-linguistic perspective.

ISBN 13: 978-81-246-0747-3

Rs. 425/-US \$ 17.00 xvi |

#### ADVAITA METAPHYSICS

Cit (Intelligence) Ānanda (Bliss)

Identity of Jīva and Brahman

# Critique of Advaitism — K.S. Murty Definition of Brahman: Annotation

Satyam (Reality)

Jñānam (Knowledge)

Anantam (Infinity)

Advaita Methodology: Anubhava and

Revelation: Analysis

Anubhava

Revelation

Reason

## 4. Śańkara Vedānta: An Alternative Perspective — Ganeswar Misra

Method of Advaita Vedānta: Śabda Pramāṇa

Adhyāsa

Identity Proposition (Akhandartha Vakya)

Saccidānanda: An Analysis

Sat

Cit

Ānanda

#### **Epilogue**

Constructive Review

Malkani: Theistic Monism

Murty: Critique of Non-Dualism

Misra: Linguistic Analysis of Advaita Concepts

Bibliography

Index

1

141 150

10

11

11

12

12

12

132

137

153